

A regular meeting of the Oxford City Council was called to order by Mayor Kate Rousmaniere on Tuesday, September 3, 2019 at 7:17 p.m. Those members present were Steve Dana, Glenn Ellerbe, David Prytherch, Chantel Raghu, Mike Smith and Edna Southard.

Staff members present: Mr. Doug Elliott, City Manager; Ms. Jessica Greene, Assistant City Manager; Mr. Mike Dreisbach, Service Director; Mr. John Jones, Police Chief; Mr. Joe Newlin, Finance Director; Mr. Sam Perry, Community Development Director; Casey Wooddell, Parks & Recreation Director; Mr. John Detherage, Fire Chief; Mr. Chris Conard, Acting Law Director and Ms. Mary Ann Eaton, Clerk of Council.

ADJOURN TO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Dana moved to adjourn to Executive Session immediately in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)1 for the purpose of discussing appointments to Boards and Commissions. Mr. Smith seconded. The motion was adopted by the following roll call:

AYE: Mr. Ellerbe, Mr. Prytherch, Ms. Raghu Mr. Smith, Ms. Southard, Mr. Dana,
Mayor Rousmaniere (7)

NAY: None (0)

ABS: None (0)

ADJOURN FROM EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Dana moved to adjourn from Executive Session at 7:30 p.m. Ms. Southard seconded. The motion passed 7-0-0.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Mr. Ellerbe moved to amend the agenda to add Appointments to Boards and Commissions under Public Participation just prior to Public Comments. Mr. Dana seconded. The motion passed 7-0-0.

Mr. Ellerbe moved to approve the agenda as amended. Mr. Dana seconded. The motion passed 7-0-0.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Mayor Rousmaniere requested the Pledge of Allegiance.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

ANNUAL REPORT **POLICE COMMUNITY RELATIONS** **& REVIEW COMMISSION**

Mr. Pat Meade, Chair, of the Police Community Relations & Review Commission noted per the statute that formed the commission an annual report of their activities is to be presented to Council. Mr. Meade advised he hoped Councilors received the report in advance and had a chance to read it. Mr. Meade noted he was sure the report would be posted on the City's website. Mr. Meade advised the commission was formed in December of 2015 to improve relations between the public and the Police Division, to establish a complaint process, to give advice to the Police Division and the City Manager and to improve police accountability and credibility with the public. Mr. Meade noted the commission met 4 times last year and advised a reoccurring theme was gathering data on who is stopped, who is arrested, who is given citations, and get the data according to race, gender, etc. Mr. Meade advised the commission would continue to push for stop data so they know who is being stopped, who is getting warned and who is getting cited. Mr. Meade noted that data is part of the Police Collaborative that Chief Jones is involved in and the department is trying to meet those standards by 2020. Mr. Meade advised he felt the data helps with public perceptions of policing. Mr. Meade advised the commission felt Oxford had an awesome police force and Police Chief noting the commission has been very appreciative of Chief Jones and his transparency with them. Mr. Meade noted the commission has a formal complaint procedure and advised nothing in the three years since the commission was formed has risen to be a formal complaint as complaints have been dealt with on a lower level and Chief Jones informs the commission of any complaints regarding OPD. Mr. Meade advised the commission's goal was to increase their outreach and communication with different demographic groups in Oxford as a lot of people do not know the commission exists. Mr. Meade noted the commission felt perception was everything when it comes to how people feel and how police officers feel. Mr. Meade advised the commission would like to join the National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement which is a collection of political subdivisions that have police oversight commissions. Mr. Meade noted the commission meets 4 times per year and advised if citizens wanted a certain item placed on the agenda they should go to the City's website to email a member of the commission or speak during public participation at a meeting. Mr. Meade thanked Council for establishing the commission and thanked Mr. Elliott and Chief Jones for their transparency and cooperation.

Mr. Dana and Mayor Rousmaniere thanked Mr. Meade for his leadership in chairing the commission.

REPORT **SHORT TERM RENTAL FINDINGS**

Mr. Perry reminded everyone an Ordinance was adopted in April that resulted in a registration requirement for short term rentals. Mr. Perry advised staff estimated there were 40-60 short term rentals in Oxford at any given time and noted 55 were currently registered. Mr. Perry advised the registration requirement was not a land use regulation it was in the Business Code so staff can track the status of short term rentals for future zoning and/or land use regulations. Mr. Perry noted staff created an on-line form for the registration and there was no fee involved.

Mr. Perry provided slides depicting where the short term rentals were located noting there was a “hot spot” around the Locust Street business corridor, there were some in the Mile Square and some in the outlying neighborhoods as well. Mr. Perry advised 31% of the registered properties had been short term rentals for 3-5 years and 31% were new and had never been rented at the time of the survey. Mr. Perry noted 58% of the dwellings were single-family, 27% were triplexes and 15% were duplexes. Mr. Perry advised approximately 1/3 of the dwellings were the owner’s primary residence and approximately 2/3 of the dwellings were not primary residences. Mr. Perry discussed the average number of days rented per month which ranged from zero to 10 or more days. Mr. Perry noted some internal data was collected regarding complaints or violations at short term rental property addresses and advised since 2016 there had been 10 noise complaints, 3 parking complaints, 1 litter complaint and 2 civil citations were issued by the Police Division. Mr. Perry advised there were no zoning violations and no violations were on record with the Fire Department. Mr. Perry noted staff received a response from Miami University Professor, Mark Tremblay who is doing research on this topic nationally and may partner with the City at some point regarding potential policies for short term rentals. Mr. Perry advised the zoning code was outdated as it requires a conditional use permit for Bed & Breakfasts and does not address this type of market. Mr. Perry noted he felt the City should start enforcing the conditional use permit requirement for short term rentals or develop new language that would adapt and be up to date for the short term rental market.

Mr. Dana inquired if there was anything injuries in having the conditional use requirement on the books. Mr. Perry noted from his perspective it was the amount of time it takes to get the approval (or denial), and the administrative cost to boards, commissions and staff for something in his opinion does not create a visible nuisance impact on a neighborhood.

Mr. Prytherch inquired what the next step was with regard to short term rental policies. Mr. Perry advised his goal was to have a firm policy in place by the end of the year or early next year.

PROCLAMATION
“PROSTATE CANCER
AWARENESS MONTH”

Mayor Rousmaniere read the Proclamation noting it was a very sobering one and advised it would be mailed to the person who requested it.

NOTICE TO
LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

Stock Transfer for Fridge & Pantry, Inc. DBA Fridge & Pantry Uptown Market 3 E. Church Street Oxford, Ohio 45056.

Mr. Elliott advised this was a stock transfer noting there was a change in the ownership of the establishment and noted Council was required to acknowledge it.

Ms. Southard moved to accept the notice without comment. Mr. Dana seconded. The motion passed 7-0-0.

APPOINTMENTS TO BOARDS & COMMISSIONS

Mr. Dana moved to appoint Carole Katz to the Public Arts Commission of Oxford and Hannah Stohry to the Police Community Relations & Review Commission. Mr. Prytherch seconded. The motion passed 7-0-0.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ms. Terri Spahr Nelson, Autumn Drive, advised she was speaking as an individual citizen concerned about affordable housing in Oxford noting she was not representing any group and does not have expertise in this area. Ms. Spahr Nelson advised she was a longtime community member (31 years) and noted as far as she can tell this has been an issue ever since then. Ms. Spahr Nelson recognized the work of the Housing Advisory Commission and their upcoming report which she looks forward to seeing. Ms. Spahr Nelson also recognized Council for ranking this issue as number 2 of their strategic plan in February. Ms. Spahr Nelson advised she recognized this was a complex multi-faceted issue noting unfortunately it was one the community has been dealing with for a long time and noted she was not sure we have gotten even close to addressing it in our community. Ms. Spahr Nelson advised the reason she was here this evening was because she saw an article in the newspaper and she thought if we do not address this now, when will we? Ms. Spahr Nelson noted the article was regarding an upcoming proposal at South Farm and advised while it may be a very fine proposal she felt if we do not take action now on creating affordable housing in our community when will we do it? Ms. Spahr Nelson asked Council to either declare a moratorium or defer voting on any future housing developments until such time that a comprehensive affordable housing plan is developed for our community noting she felt it could be done in a timely manner. Ms. Spahr Nelson stated if Council can not do that she would ask them to defer the vote until a new Council is in place after the election so they might be able to thoroughly address this issue. Ms. Spahr Nelson noted she wanted to point out some facts for the record from the census – as of 2018 there were 6,006 households in Oxford, 22,885 community members, the median household income was reported at \$26,816 and 47% of persons in Oxford live in poverty. Ms. Spahr Nelson advised a significant number of people in our community live in poverty and can not afford housing. Ms. Spahr Nelson noted there were only 5 homes for sale right now in Oxford under \$200,000, 12 were available for \$200,000 - \$300,000 and 11 were available from \$300,000 to \$669,000. Ms. Spahr Nelson advised HUD reports housing as being affordable if a person is spending 30% or below of their income on housing expenses. Ms. Spahr Nelson noted she wanted to address the proposal for South Farm.

Mayor Rousmaniere reminded Ms. Spahr Nelson that the Public Comments portion of the agenda was for comments regarding items that were not on the agenda. Mayor Rousmaniere advised Ms. Spahr Nelson she could speak again once the South Farm proposal was being discussed.

Ms. Spahr Nelson advised a community was being built on Olde Farm Road and there were several lots available. Ms. Spahr Nelson noted the lots were \$70,000 and she did not know how much the houses would be sold for once they are built although from the pictures they looked like very nice houses.

Ms. Spahr Nelson advised the community already has houses for people who are in that price range. Ms. Spahr Nelson noted there were many resources and options available for dealing with affordable housing and advised it was not just about the market. Ms. Spahr Nelson encouraged Council to work with the HAC to get some more information to make sure this issue is addressed. Ms. Spahr Nelson noted it was time to draw a line in the sand and say if we do not address this now when will we?

Ms. Kathleen Zien, Joseph Drive, noted she had hoped after Mr. Perry's report that Council would have asked for public comments regarding short term rentals.

Ms. Zien noted her hope before next Wednesday's HAPC meeting Councilors will review last month's (August 14) HAPC agenda. Ms. Zien advised she sent Councilors a link to it the day of the meeting. Ms. Zien noted it was a proposal for another house to be built on a lot not only facing an alley but it seems a second house also called the principal building in the staff report is on the lot. Ms. Zien advised the memo from Sam Perry says "a pre-application discussion regarding a proposed new dwelling in the alley behind 116 W. Church Street". Ms. Zien noted perhaps more appropriately it should have been phrased in the back yard of the current home facing the alley. Ms. Zien advised since a pre-application has no background information from the applicant there is nothing to go on but the staff report. Ms. Zien noted she had been to the address twice to see what she was missing and advised she does not see a vacant lot to build another house on other than the backyard space for the current historic residence at 116 Church. Ms. Zien stated perhaps Mr. Perry knows if the backyard was subdivided into another lot and he can advise. Ms. Zien noted she thought Oxford code restricted building two homes on one property or one lot and advised by the tax records 116 W. Church does not appear to be a subdivided lot yet. Ms. Zien noted agents, owners and developers coming before commissions manage an end run around our code restrictions. Ms. Zien advised you only have to walk town to find a narrow 4 foot long breezeway connecting two large wings as an approved addition for a single home which really stretches the limits of the code. Ms. Zien noted the HAPC meeting report on page 31 of Council's packet indicates this was a pre-application for a "new principal building". Ms. Zien stated if so, then what do we call the large 2.5 story with a 2,045' building footprint already on that lot. Ms. Zien noted that was a principal building and likely takes up more than half of the lot's square footage for proper setbacks. Ms. Zien advised the large white colonial is on the Oxford Walking Tour and is historic for Oxford built in 1904. Ms. Zien noted the house has a rental permit for 12 and a dozen cars likely serve the occupants. Ms. Zien advised its limited eastside setback used for diagonal parking along the alley next to the vacated phone company might be grandfathered. Ms. Zien noted adding what the staff report lists as another principal building and more occupancy should be questionable even to a novice. Ms. Zien advised the historic home should not have a building, a student rental no less, in its backyard. Ms. Zien noted the property would not be big enough for two principal buildings on a ¼ acre lot without stretching the reality of setbacks and parking requirements. Ms. Zien advised every project should not come to BZA as a matter of course with variance approvals. Ms. Zien noted there is no 118 W. Church as a viable address which is referenced in the case number. Ms. Zien advised 118 W. was listed in the August HAPC agenda and in tonight's meeting report, but it is not an address on the Butler County Auditor's website. Ms. Zien noted if this is the address the proposed building might be assigned then the address should have been noted as speculative on the application, case file and staff report. Ms. Zien asked Council to please review this HAPC item before next week.

Ms. Kathy McMahon Klosterman, 165 Shadowy Hills Drive, thanked Terri Spahr Nelson for all of the information she shared and urged Council to delay decisions until the Housing Advisory Commission's report has been read and understood by the community.

Mayor Rousmaniere advised the HAC Affordable Housing Study will be ready by the end of the month.

Ms. Janis Dutton, Vine Street, noted MarkTwain supposedly said that when he died he wanted to die in Cincinnati because everything there happened 10 years later. Ms. Dutton advised in Oxford it was more like 20-30 years later. Ms. Dutton noted she felt we needed to change the way we think about affordable housing and the way we talk about it. Ms. Dutton advised affordable housing is policy, it is not charity. Ms. Dutton noted if we switch to policy in how we address the needs of everyone in the community and get away from the fact that it is a charity model she felt we could make better progress.

CONSENT AGENDA

MINUTES

Minutes of the August 19, 2019 City Council Work Session. (Mary Ann Eaton, Clerk of Council)

Minutes of the August 20, 2019 City Council Work Session. (Mary Ann Eaton, Clerk of Council)

Minutes of the August 20, 2019 City Council Meeting. (Mary Ann Eaton, Clerk of Council)

REPORT

Report regarding the August 13, 2019 Planning Commission Meeting. (Sam Perry, Community Development Director)

RESOLUTION

AUTHORIZING TAX LEVIES

A Resolution No. 7100 accepting the amounts and rates as determined by the Budget Commission of Butler County, Ohio and authorizing the necessary tax levies and certifying them to the County Auditor. (Joe Newlin, Finance Director)

Mr. Dana moved to approve the Consent Agenda. Ms. Southard seconded. The motion passed 7-0-0.

RESOLUTIONS

RESOLUTION **ENDORSING THE** **GLOBAL COVENANT OF MAYORS** **FOR CLIMATE AND ENERGY**

A Resolution No. 7101 of the Council of the City of Oxford, Ohio, endorsing the Global Covenant of Mayors for Climate and Energy. (David Prytherch, Councilor)

Mr. Prytherch advised we in our community recognize that climate change is among a number of sustainability challenges noting the Comprehensive Plan is really about sustainability and he felt a few sustainability issues are perhaps a greater challenge to us right now than climate issues. Mr. Prytherch advised once upon a time we thought of this as a global issue but it a local issue, emissions are local and impacts will be local. Mr. Prytherch noted this was a public welfare challenge for us and it is a significant challenge in that it is going to take some time. Mr. Prytherch advised in order to combat the challenge we need to take action that is significant. Mr. Prytherch noted local action makes a difference because emissions come from cities, transportation, buildings, etc. Mr. Prytherch advised because Council set sustainability as its top priority and looking at climate action is one of its top objectives Council appointed a Climate Action Task Force that was charged with answering the question what kind of green house gas emissions reduction should the City make and in what time horizon, and should a framework be assigned such as the Global Covenant of Mayors for Climate and Energy or something else. Mr. Prytherch thanked those who served on the Steering Committee who represented staff, community members and board and commission members. Mr. Prytherch noted a lot of folks attended the one public engagement session that was held over the summer including representatives from Miami University. Mr. Prytherch advised the Task Force recommendations which were discussed at the last meeting included making a commitment as a first step because it is the guiding framework that 9000 plus other cities are using right now, integrate that into the Comprehensive Plan so we are not developing something separate, integrate these things into our everyday decision making and balance the workload. Mr. Prytherch noted the City needed to partner and maintain communications with Miami University and with the surrounding townships. Mr. Prytherch advised the first step in the process was to adopt the Resolution before Council which is making a political commitment and embarking on a process that hopefully leads us towards neutrality. Mr. Prytherch noted this was a phased process which begins with things like inventorying emissions and determining vulnerabilities. Mr. Prytherch advised within two years the green house gas inventory needs to be done then risks are assessed and voluntary targets are set. Mr. Prytherch noted within 3 years a Climate Action Plan needs to be developed and integrated within a new Comprehensive Plan and ultimately the progress is publically reported.

Ms. Jenny Fisher, 3 Quail Ridge Drive, thanked Mr. Prytherch for all of the work he has done on this very important issue. Ms. Fisher noted in addition to encouraging Council to adopt the proposed Resolution she wanted to share that she recently purchased solar panels for her home and offered business cards in the event the City wanted to purchase solar panels for municipal buildings. Ms. Fisher advised in addition to having a positive effect for carbon, she found the solar panels to be cost effective.

Ms. Southard noted her support for the proposed Resolution noting individually we all have to act whether its solar panels or low emission cars or driving less and clustering errands. Ms. Southard advised any impact on climate change was for the best.

Mr. Dana advised he felt this was an urgent matter and Council should go forward with adopting the proposed Resolution. Mr. Dana noted the amount of work that has been done under Mr. Prytherch's direction has been superior and sets Council to a point where they have all of the capabilities of making a difference which is good for Oxford's world and the world beyond.

Mayor Rousmaniere advised she supported the Resolution although she questioned whether Oxford has the capability to follow through with the commitments. Mayor Rousmaniere noted the Climate Action Task Force did not volunteer to do the greenhouse gas inventory. Mayor Rousmaniere advised the IES students are going to complete a greenhouse gas inventory this spring of all City services and noted the next step is to do a greenhouse gas study of the entire community which includes all private residences and businesses. Mayor Rousmaniere noted she would like to know how that is going to be accomplished. Mayor Rousmaniere advised she was concerned that there are no recuperations for signing the document and not accomplishing what was set out. Mayor Rousmaniere noted to her this was a symbolic move and a political move. Mayor Rousmaniere asked the community for help in this endeavor as City staff was over burdened noting the ability to do a greenhouse gas inventory of all private businesses and citizens in two years is something she questions.

Mr. Jonathon Levy, 214 W. Withrow Street, Director of the Institute for the Environment and Sustainability at Miami University, noted just because there is no penalty does not mean the covenant is symbolic. Mr. Levy advised these are real moves to do real things to help the community and the world. Mr. Levy noted he thought there could be some real advantages as far as attracting students to come to Miami University. Mr. Levy advised he thought students were going to look more and more to choose colleges in places that are thinking ahead and thinking progressively about the right thing to do in the world. Mr. Levy noted if we want to attract the best students he felt this was something Oxford should do. Mr. Levy advised the Institute for the Environment and Sustainability has participated in this work for many years and will continue to do so.

Ms. Raghu asked for comments on the software that is being used as she knew it simplifies models that can be recreated to figure out what the community emissions are.

Ms. Suzi Zazycki, Country Club Drive, Associate Director, Institute for the Environment and Sustainability, advised a group of graduate students were exploring the Clear Path tool and she knew what the marketing materials say about the Clear Path tool and the modeling modules. Ms. Zazycki noted this year's team of graduate students will explore those modules and plug numbers in to learn how to use it so they can teach the City how to use it. Ms. Zazycki advised the City has a membership in the organization that is providing access to the tool noting the membership expires in March. Ms. Zazycki advised if we can get the data for the greenhouse gas inventory that is where Miami University will need participation from the City then the students can plug that in and learn how to use the tool. Ms. Zazycki advised the goal is to have some feedback by March regarding the effectiveness of the tool.

Mr. Ellerbe noted when he asked the question regarding consequences of not doing this he felt there would be a consequence for the City. Mr. Ellerbe advised Council will have given their word for this initiative and if it fails they have shown themselves as untrustworthy. Mr. Ellerbe noted he can see why Mayor Rousmaniere is discussing the workload. Mr. Ellerbe agreed that staff has quite a bit of work on their plate already and Council needs to lean on the community to accomplish this task. Mr. Ellerbe noted his hope this could be accomplished within the next two years with the help of the community.

Ms. Raghu advised she felt this was not optional noting climate change is real and Council decided sustainability was their number one priority. Ms. Raghu stated if you can not make all of your goals dream big and keep trying.

Ms. Sandy Woy-Hazleton, noted the community has shown its support and advised one of the first meetings was held in April and 50 community members showed up to show they are interested in doing this. Ms. Woy-Hazleton advised she felt there were not only students but retired people that could help. Ms. Woy-Hazleton noted there were many community members including herself that support the project.

Ms. Prue Dana, 131 W. Collins Street, advised she was part of the citizen committee of the task force noting there is so much the City is already doing because of City staff. Ms. Dana advised Mr. Dreisbach is looking at what can be done next noting the City has led lights and offers food composting. Ms. Dana advised Mr. Newlin has the figures on how much the City spends on gas per year. Ms. Dana noted having the community behind us is recognizing what is being done and taking it to the next step. Ms. Dana advised she felt we are part of a local, national, global concern of how important this is and noted we need to step up and do our duty.

Mr. Smith advised he supported this initiative noting what we are doing now is a decades long forever process to get where we want to go and eventually be there. Mr. Smith noted if the City sees it can not accomplish the study in two years all Council has to do is put out the call for help and the town will help. Mr. Smith advised the City has to start and might as well start here.

Mr. Prytherch reiterated this was a phased process towards a goal. Mr. Prytherch noted the comprehensive plan was full of lofty goals such as preserving farm land, maintaining small town character and create jobs and advised the City does not do that on its own.

Mr. Smith moved to adopt Resolution No. 7101. Mr. Dana seconded. The motion passed 7-0-0.

RESOLUTION
EXTENDING THE
BICYCLE & E-SCOOTER SHARING PROGRAM

A Resolution No. 7102 of the Council of the City of Oxford, Ohio, authorizing the City Manager to extend the Pilot Program for a bicycle and e-scooter sharing system permit. (Doug Elliott, City Manager)

Mr. Elliott advised last year City Council approved a pilot program for a Bicycle and E-Scooter sharing system permit. Mr. Elliott noted the rules and regulations included regulations for parking, operations, safety standards and data sharing.

Mr. Elliott advised initially two eScooter companies showed interest in the program and currently one company (Lime) is operating within the City. Mr. Elliott noted he believed it was fair to say that the program has been successful as it has provided students and other citizens another option for their local transportation needs. Mr. Elliott recommended that Council authorize him to continue the pilot program for another year. Mr. Elliott noted staff would come back later in the year or early next year with regulations to be codified. Mr. Elliott reminded everyone to park the eScooters responsibly and to ride them responsibly. Mr. Elliott advised parking eScooters on campus has been a problem which results in them being impounded. Mr. Elliott noted that will affect the success of the program since the impound fee is \$100 per scooter.

Mayor Rousmaniere inquired if there were any comments from the public and there were none.

Ms. Southard noted Council should ask citizens to act responsibly and park the scooters safely so they do not impede the sidewalks making them difficult to negotiate especially for someone in a wheelchair or someone with other disabilities.

Ms. Raghu advised her main like about the program was that intuitively it seems like pollution would be reduced from cars because people are riding eScooters. Ms. Raghu noted she attended a meeting with other elected officials from around the country and one of them referenced a study that was done in Amsterdam that showed that the eScooters did not actually reduce driving a car, all it did was reduce the amount people were walking. Ms. Raghu advised she would like to see a survey done showing if people using e-Scooters would have walked or driven somewhere. Ms. Raghu noted she wanted to make sure the program was achieving the goal she hoped it was achieving.

Mr. Elliott noted he did not think the eScooters were doing much to reduce automobile driving but they were providing another means of transportation. Mr. Elliott reminded everyone the program was implemented after the Student Community Relations Commission asked for Council to consider it.

Ms. Southard moved to adopt Resolution No. 7102. Mr. Dana seconded. The motion passed 7-0-0.

RESOLUTION
SUPPORTING THE SUBMISSION OF A
GRANT APPLICATION

A Resolution No. 7103 of Council supporting the submission of a grant application for Ohio Public Works Commission Issue 1 funds in the amount of \$103,250.00 to be used for the repair and relining of storm-water culverts on US27 North. (Mike Dreisbach, Service Director)

Mr. Dreisbach advised during the CIP budget discussions staff talked about the need to repair and reline two culverts on US27 North. Mr. Dreisbach noted since that time staff believes the City can be competitive with an Ohio Public Works Commission grant application. Mr. Dreisbach advised staff was seeking Council's approval to apply for a grant to pay for approximately \$103,000 of the project and the City would fund \$72,000 of the project locally.

Mayor Rousmaniere inquired if there were any comments from the public and there were none.

Mr. Dana inquired if the current condition of the culverts was considered dangerous in any way. Mr. Dreisbach advised ODOT noted deficiencies in the bottom lining of the pipe and advised this was not an immediate hazard but should be resolved in the near future.

Mr. Prytherch advised the City has a good track record with grant applications and noted his support for the grant application.

Mr. Dana moved to adopt Resolution No. 7103. Ms. Southard seconded. The motion passed 7-0-0.

ORDINANCES

FIRST READING

ORDINANCE

PRELIMINARY PLANNED DEVELOPMENT & PRELIMINARY SUBDIVISION APPLICATION

An Ordinance Accepting the Recommendation Of The Planning Commission And Approving The Preliminary Planned Development And Preliminary Subdivision Application For South Farm Section Two With Conditions. (Sam Perry, Community Development Director)

Mr. Ellerbe recused himself due to the proximity of his residence to the proposed development.

Mr. Perry advised Etta Reed of Bayer Becker submitted a preliminary subdivision plat application and a planned development application in June which was reviewed by the Planning Commission in August. Mr. Perry noted South Farm Development LLC is the owner of the property in question and the representatives were Mike Shea and John Boyle. Mr. Perry advised the site was 6.7 acres of vacant land which would be re-platted from 13 lots to 25 lots. Mr. Perry provided PowerPoint slides of the boundaries, zoning map, existing roadway, land ownership and surrounding properties. Mr. Perry advised there is no mature vegetation on the property which used to be farmland. Mr. Perry provided slides of the proposed development as depicted on pages 112-113 of Council packet and discussed the proposal in detail as outlined on pages 58 through 131 of Council's packet. Mr. Perry advised the Planning Commission recommended approval of the development with conditions as shown on page 59 of Council's packet noting condition 1 was revised as the applicant had concerns with the timing of the turn-around and the financial security for it. Mr. Perry noted an arrangement was made for it to be built to the City Engineer and Fire Chief's standards without having a timing or financial security requirement. Mr. Perry discussed the waiver requests from the applicant as shown on pages 59-60 of Council's packet. Mr. Perry noted the Planning Commission reviewed in detail the general intent of the zoning code and the comprehensive plan and felt the proposal met the general intent of each. Mr. Perry advised surrounding property owners spoke at the Planning Commission Meeting noting there was some confusion about the price point of the homes which was clarified by the applicant. Mr. Perry advised the price of the homes is not a decision standard of the Planning Commission or City Council. Mr. Perry noted there is a decision standard in the Planned Development Ordinance regarding diversity in housing types and advised this is a housing type that Oxford does not have a lot of.

Mr. Perry advised the proposed houses would have a compact floorplan and a Homeowners Association would maintain the common areas. Mr. Perry discussed the recommended conditions for approval as shown on pages 56-57 of Council's packet. Mr. Perry noted the decision standards were in Council's packet on pages 65-66 although he was not going to address all 25 of them this evening. Mr. Prytherch asked Mr. Perry to address the role of the decision standards. Mr. Perry advised since the City is divided into zoning districts there is an expectation that property owners have a right to use property as they see fit within the guidelines of the City. Mr. Perry noted if this proposal was a traditional subdivision the amount of input and negotiation that the City could have would be limited. Mr. Perry advised since the proposal is a planned development there is opportunity for give and take. Mayor Rousmaniere noted the decision standards deal specifically with design standards, construction standards and zoning.

Ms. Southard noted the proposed development will eventually be a Neighborhood Conservation Overlay District which Mr. Perry addressed.

Ms. Etta Reed, Bayer Becker, advised she and Mike Shea with South Farm Development LLC would answer any questions regarding the home styles or the homes to be constructed. Ms. Reed provided PowerPoint slides and noted she was excited to bring something a little different to Council noting these would be detached (stand alone) single family homes on 25 individual lots in a cluster type setting. Ms. Reed advised the homes would not have large yards keeping a lot of open space and the natural ground that is there. Ms. Reed noted there were currently 13 lots and advised 2 streets were dedicated in 1998, it was re-platted in 2007 to make the right-of-way 60 feet when it was originally 50 feet. Ms. Reed noted the development would have its own water quality basin. Ms. Reed advised there would be 25 single family lots, 13 on the east side and 12 on the west side and noted eventually there would be direct access to the trail system. Ms. Reed advised Roberts Drive and Hoover Drive would be dedicated public streets and the alley will be a private alley maintained by the Homeowners Association in accordance with the Fire Code. Ms. Reed noted the exterior home maintenance will be provided by the Homeowners Association including lawn mowing, snow removal and landscaping which is an amenity that is brought to this development. Ms. Reed advised 25% open space was being provided noting it was usable space. Ms. Reed provided slides of the proposed homes noting the front loaded homes (garages attached to the front) are 1,300 square feet minimum, and all of the homes can be ranches or two stories, with or without basements. Ms. Reed advised the homes would have a mix of building products on the outside including stone, siding and brick. Ms. Reed noted the rear loaded homes will sit closer to the street on the west side of Hoover Drive. Ms. Reed discussed the waivers being requested as outlined on pages 59 and 60 of Council's packet. Ms. Reed discussed a new waiver the developer was requesting which was the right to encroach into the buffer yard to the south. Ms. Reed noted during a meeting with the City Engineer, Planner and the Fire Chief they decided to eliminate the turn around because the alley will be conducive for all emergency vehicles although in order to do that an encroachment into the 25' setback will be needed. Ms. Reed advised she and the developer were fully on board with all of the conditions for approval as listed on pages 56-57 of Council's packet.

Mr. Dana inquired if anything could be done with the lot coverage to support rear garages on the east side of Hoover Drive. Ms. Reed advised she and the developer looked at providing an alley on both sides of the development and decided it was not feasible and they would like to provide diversity in the product.

Ms. Southard noted the issue if safety was raised by the Fire Chief and the Police Chief and advised she felt those concerns have been addressed very satisfactorily. Ms. Southard advised the trail will be adjacent to the proposed development and inquired if there will be a landscaping buffer between the trail and the homes. Ms. Reed advised there would be a tree lawn and street trees will be provided as required by code.

Mr. Mike Rudolph, 200 Morgan Circle advised he has lived in the existing South Farm Subdivision for 25 years. Mr. Rudolph noted he, his wife and neighbors greatly enjoy the quiet nature of South Farm and have been able to maintain a beautiful and attractive subdivision thanks to the work of the current South Farm Homeowners Association. Mr. Rudolph advised he spoke before the Oxford Planning Commission 3 weeks ago to share 3 issues as Planning considered the application for approval of the preliminary subdivision for South Farm Section Two. Mr. Rudolph noted it was cautiously exciting to the current residents to finally see some movement on the next phase of the subdivision and advised after Section One was completed the project went dormant for many years. Mr. Rudolph noted Cobblestone Community Church acquired a significant portion of land in South Farm to build their church center and has been a great neighbor and a member of the South Farm Homeowners Association ever since. Mr. Rudolph advised Section Two was originally platted with 13 lots on an approximately 6.7 acre development site noting while he and his neighbors would like to see the site developed as platted with the lot sizes and density that match the look and feel of the current 11 homes in South Farm Section One they do realize that times have changed. Mr. Rudolph noted contrary to a prior public comment he finds that Oxford is experiencing a shortage of housing supply at all square footage and pricing points and especially needs moderate sized homes to attract residents away from the likes of Liberty Township, West Chester and Fairfield. Mr. Rudolph advised the three issues the Homeowners Association brought forth were not in opposition to future development of the site but are issues raised because they want any new development to be successful. Mr. Rudolph noted all 3 issues he shared with the Planning Commission he believes have a very workable outlook. Mr. Rudolph advised the first issue concerns the creation of a separate Homeowners Association for this proposed Section Two subdivision noting the maintenance free nature of the proposed subdivision requires a fee to be assessed for those services which would be the responsibility of the HOA. Mr. Rudolph noted a successful HOA already exists for the current South Farm development and assesses a fee to the current homeowners for maintenance and landscaping of the common property and the retention pond. Mr. Rudolph advised each homeowner is responsible for the care of their own lot. Mr. Rudolph noted in discussions with the developer he feels confident that if South Farm Section Two becomes a reality and the new home owners will become a sub-set of the current South Farm HOA and will pay their fair share of the cost of the common property maintenance. Mr. Rudolph advised the second issue brought forth concerned no stop signs being indicated in the plans for access to Roberts Drive from either Morgan Circle or Hoover Drive and there need to be to prevent traffic issues. Mr. Rudolph noted the third issue was confirmation of the price point at which the proposed new homes would arrive at. Mr. Rudolph advised at the Planning Commission meeting the builder expressed that a starting price point would most likely be in the \$250,000 range and noted much discussion ensued between members of planning, the builder and developer about the proposed price points. Mr. Rudolph noted the builder stressed often that the target audience for these homes is empty nesters and young professionals and this type of maintenance free living is what they are looking for. Mr. Rudolph advised it should be noted publically that there is no current infrastructure at the site and it was the builder and developer's financial burden to install it all.

Mr. Rudolph noted ultimately the Planning Commission determined it was not their purview to decide if the price points were appropriate or not but rather to see if the application fit the required City requirements with variances and put the burden on the developer and the builder to sell the product. Mr. Rudolph advised he and the HOA members understand the Planning Commissions position. Mr. Rudolph briefly discussed recent Facebook postings and the issue of affordable housing.

Ms. Terri Spahr Nelson, 28 Autumn Drive, advised recently there were a few posts on Oxford Talk and noted it was amazing to see over 200 comments related to affordable housing and the concerns related to it and encouraged Council members to read them. Ms. Spahr Nelson advised HUD defines affordable housing as 30% or less of income. Ms. Spahr Nelson noted if the median income in Oxford as defined by the Census Bureau is \$26,816 Oxford does not have enough affordable housing. Ms. Spahr Nelson advised people who work here and go to school here can not afford to live here. Ms. Spahr Nelson noted this particular project looks like a fine proposal however the price point is not affordable for most Oxford citizens. Ms. Spahr Nelson suggested Council work with the builder to offer some affordable housing or some other options so that if this goes forward there are some other options for Oxford citizens.

Mayor Rousmaniere advised the City has been struggling with the census data and noted the median income of \$26,816 includes approximately \$10,000 students who report their own income not their parent's income. Mr. Elliott advised he found a census study which looked at college towns and noted off campus college students really do affect Oxford's poverty rate. Mr. Elliott advised if students are excluded the poverty rate falls dramatically from 43.8% to 17.2%.

Mayor Rousmaniere advised affordable housing is the second priority in City Council's strategic plan and noted Council appreciates everyone's concern about affordable housing as Council was concerned as well. Mayor Rousmaniere advised the Housing Advisory Commission was working on affordable housing issues.

Ms. Janis Dutton, Vine Street, advised the issue of affordable housing was before Council when she served on Council in the early 1990's. Ms. Dutton noted when looking at poverty issues on a broad brush which is what Ms. Spahr Nelson did, and then Council tweaked those numbers, and noted that does not give a valid picture. Ms. Dutton advised maybe people who work at Miami University can not afford to live here which reduces the poverty rate because they do not live here anymore. Ms. Dutton noted she found on Miami University's website what the AFSME workers make and the proposed subdivision is out of range for those people. Ms. Dutton cautioned everyone to be careful not to make a broad claim regarding Oxford's poverty level.

Ms. Kathy McMahon Klosterman, 165 Shadowy Hills Drive, advised she was concerned with regard to disability access if there are no sidewalks in the proposed development. Mayor Rousmaniere advised there were sidewalks on both sides of Hoover Drive.

Ms. Raghu advised 40% of the Talawanda School District population qualify for free lunches. Ms. Raghu noted maybe people are being sheltered within their own socioeconomic status. Ms. Raghu advised she knew staff members at Miami University who were her age and can not afford to rent in Oxford, have a difficult time finding apartments and certainly can not purchase a home in Oxford.

Ms. Raghu noted it was not a made up statistic when we look at what the definition of affordability is. Ms. Raghu inquired what type of data was assessed by the Housing Advisory Commission. Mr. Perry advised it was a very narrow scope noting there were no interviews of individuals and noted it was a survey of the existing market. Mr. Perry advised the preliminary results are that Oxford does have affordable housing across a wide spectrum of the City but the supply is very low. Mr. Perry noted the affordable units are full and there is a waiting list for them.

Mr. Prytherch advised Mayor Rousmaniere asked him to speak on behalf of the Housing Advisory Commission (HAC). Mr. Prytherch noted there is great concern on Council and on HAC about affordable housing, diversity and affordability in Oxford's housing stock. Mr. Prytherch noted affordable housing was a comprehensive plan goal which is why Mr. Perry has taken the first step of commissioning a housing study. Mr. Prytherch advised some of this is a policy process that is going to take a while to fully wrap our minds around what is the nature of our current housing market, what is the nature of the demand, how big is the demand and what best practices are. Mr. Prytherch noted the HAC has not really done a lot to dig into the housing issue in a proactive way. Mr. Prytherch advised the first step was reinvigorating the HAC and a report will be forthcoming. Mr. Prytherch noted some policy changes have been made and will continue to be made that will potentially effect developments generally. Mr. Prytherch noted the Ordinance Council was considering was a specific project that Council will vote on in relation to the code as it is now and the decision standards that are in place. Mr. Prytherch advised the marketplace is not always going to lean towards producing the affordable housing that we want noting he has to separate out the policy matters that are happening at the dais and the decision standards on a specific project that Council is considering.

Mr. Dana advised he agreed with Ms. Dutton's statement that affordable housing is policy not charity noting that policy is something Council wants to work on.

Mr. Prytherch welcomed the interest in the affordable housing issues and advised the planner in him knows that if he recommends Council defers acting on this because a policy will be developed in the future he can see the law suit that is coming Oxford's way and Oxford would lose it. Mr. Prytherch noted he sees that a lot of work went into this proposal by the Planning Commission and staff. Mr. Prytherch advised this compact development reduces impact on the natural areas of the site and noted he felt it was a very efficient use of the land. Mr. Prytherch advised he felt the proposal conforms with the zoning code.

Mr. Dana asked Ms. Reed if there was any merit in the assertion that because this is compact development and therefore more efficient that it allows the developer to be more efficient in the use of construction materials and thereby have a lower price point. Ms. Reed advised each home will look somewhat similar on the exterior and noted the finishes inside will be different which will affect the pricing. Ms. Reed advised each house is custom done so there will be some efficiencies although the alley adds a lot of cost.

Mayor Rousmaniere advised she liked this proposal noting she is involved in work with the senior community in Oxford that has been looking for small, compact single level homes. Mayor Rousmaniere advised for the age friendly Oxford community she felt this was a real find.

Ms. Southard noted price point is not part of Council's decision standards and Council can not make a decision based on the price point. Ms. Southard advised previously when Council has discussed developments and housing Council has learned that price points are flexible and fluid. Ms. Southard noted people will only pay what the demand is and advised the price might be different because of its location. Ms. Southard noted people may not pay an astronomical sum in a location that does not meet a high demand. Ms. Southard asked when working with a developer and people are talking about price points at what point is that the final word on the price and how is that determined and how will that affect the final price being paid. Ms. Reed advised right now Mr. Boyle is looking at \$200,000 to \$250,000 as a starting point. Ms. Reed noted the builder has the cost of the land, the cost of building two public streets and an alley, all utilities have to be installed as well as landscaping. Ms. Reed advised once the construction drawings are done the developer will have a better handle on the price.

Mr. Prytherch noted this style of compact development by its structural nature should drive down the cost.

Ms. Margaret Beckwith, Kehr Road, noted there could be 2 cars for each of the houses that would use Kehr Road which is getting pretty difficult right now. Ms. Beckwith inquired if that had been calculated in.

Mr. Perry advised the trip generation or traffic impact is typically reviewed by the City Engineer and the Applicant Engineer. Mr. Perry noted the City Engineer has stated in a memo that a traffic impact study is not required. Mr. Dana advised he remembered reading that they identified the number of cars coming in and out and reached that conclusion. Mr. Prytherch noted the trip generation rates are based on land uses and what they are expected to generate. Mr. Prytherch advised it points out that our infrastructure is not always up to the growth coming our way and Kehr Road is a perfect example of that. Mr. Prytherch noted these folks will have a sidewalk within their subdivision but no way to get into town yet. Mayor Rousmaniere advised she hoped Kehr Road will be improved in the near future and noted it has been an area of concern for some time.

Mayor Rousmaniere advised Council would vote on this proposal at their next meeting.

Mr. Ellerbe returned to the dais.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Mr. Elliott commented on the last week's Community Picnic and Police Station Ribbon Cutting & Open House noting the open house was well attended by community members. Mr. Elliott thanked John Buchholz and the many volunteers that made the Community Picnic a great success. Mr. Elliott noted a new initiative this year was to do away with plastic and use compostable products.

Mr. Elliott advised he attended the Chamber of Commerce Business After Hours event last week at New-Gate Arena on High Street. Mr. Elliott noted it was a wonderful gaming and e-sports facility which was alcohol free.

Mr. Wooddell noted the season was over at the Aquatic Center at least for humans noting this Saturday was Dog Day which was done at the old pool and carried over to the new facility. Mr. Wooddell publically acknowledged Emily Sibcy, the Aquatics Coordinator noting the job she did running the facility all summer was phenomenal.

Ms. Raghu referred to the Community Picnic and noted she appreciated the City moving beyond plastic. Ms. Raghu advised she felt it took a lot of innovation from John Buchholz, Mike Dreisbach and others involved.

Ms. Raghu advised there was a food waste conference in Cincinnati on Wednesday, September 11 and invited everyone to attend. Ms. Raghu noted she was invited to speak because a lot of people are impressed by what Oxford is doing. Ms. Raghu advised Oxford was on the map for food waste and Councilors around Ohio have reached out to her asking how Oxford managed to do it. Ms. Raghu noted Oxford has baseline composting infrastructure and inquired how we can further reduce food waste and build the infrastructure that is already here from the food pantry, the Family Resource Center and churches who provide Wednesday night free meals. Ms. Raghu advised as we move up on the food waste hierarchy we will want to prevent it from happening noting 40% of food is thrown away. Ms. Raghu advised beyond that we will want to make sure the food that is going to get thrown away gets to the people who need it first, then to farm animals and then to the composting facility. Ms. Raghu noted that was something the food waste conference is building on and inquired how Oxford can be a beacon in Ohio. Mr. Raghu advised Oxford was already the recycling leader in Butler County and a composting leader which she felt was super exciting.

Mr. Ellerbe advised he liked the proposed South Farm project because it is infill and it is diverse housing. Mr. Ellerbe noted he was a member of the HAC and advised there were policy matters the HAC was trying to work on and noted they would take some time. Mr. Ellerbe discussed an anecdotal story about building a house in Oxford to try to shed some light on things he has seen on social media which he is not going to speak upon in social media because he just does not do that. At the end of the story the retail price of the cheapest house to build in Oxford was \$132,000. Mr. Ellerbe also discussed the rental market in Oxford. Mr. Ellerbe advised there are difficulties with housing in Oxford because a lot of people look at comps which is a residential pricing model and a lot of the inventory in Oxford is based on a commercial model. Mr. Ellerbe discussed a scenario where the new \$132,000 house is going to be rented and advised theoretically the cheapest house in Oxford with the cheapest rent would be \$1,100 per month or \$550 each for 2 people. Mr. Ellerbe asked people to keep that in mind when talking about an investor coming to Oxford just to build affordable housing. Mr. Ellerbe suggested community members go to Oxford on Demand on the City's website to watch and listen to this segment of the meeting noting his hope it would provide some insight for them.

Mr. Dana noted we had a fine summer in Oxford and advised the new Municipal Building, Police Station and Aquatic Center were successes. Mr. Dana noted the careful use of funds by the City Manager and the Finance Director has enabled the City to show its best to visitors and advised town gown relationship were in very good shape.

Ms. Southard noted in addition to all of the good things that happened this summer, the Community Picnic and the Police Station opening, there was the Walk About which welcomes 8,000 students to town.

Ms. Southard advised community members and students paired up and visited student residences in the pouring rain noting the students were grateful for the cookies and the information that was distributed. Ms. Southard noted this was a way to welcome student to the community and make sure they know they are part of the community and that their input is important.

Ms. Southard congratulated Jessica Greene and Andrew Wilson for establishing the City newsletter that lets people in the community know what is going on in the City. Ms. Southard noted one of Council's strategic goals that was identified is better communication and advised she felt we were working towards achieving that goal.

Mr. Prytherch expressed his gratitude for the pool, the City Buildings and the Community Picnic noting a lot of good things were happening in Oxford. Mr. Prytherch noted Oxford is a place that thinks big, is brimming over with a lot of good ideas and loves to talk about them. Mr. Prytherch advised we try to take those ideas as best we can and translate them into action that is measurable.

Mayor Rousmaniere noted for those interested in the affordable housing issue, the HAC is meeting Monday, September 16th at 1:30 p.m. at the Municipal Building. Mayor Rousmaniere advised Mr. Ellerbe and Mr. Prytherch serve on the HAC and community members can talk to them about their work on affordable housing.

Mayor Rousmaniere noted for those who are going to work with the community and the City on the Global Covenant of Mayors for Climate and Energy, the Environmental Commission meets tomorrow evening at 7:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building. Mayor Rousmaniere advised there was a vacancy on the Environmental Commission for those interested in applying to fill the vacancy.

ADJOURN

Mr. Dana moved to adjourn at 9:55 p.m. Mr. Smith seconded. The motion passed 7-0-0.